Statistics at the tip of a branching random walk, and simple models of evolution with selection

Bernard Derrida

ENS, Paris

E. Brunet 2009-2011

E. Brunet, A. H. Mueller, S. Munier 2006-2007

Saclay June 2011

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ● ● ●

Outline

Motivations

Bovier, Kurkova 2006 Aizenman, Sims, Staarr 2007 Arguin 2007 Lalley, Sellke 1987

The rightmost particle and the Fisher-KPP equation

Mc Kean 1975, Bramson 1978,1983

ション ふゆ く は マ く ほ マ く し マ

Distances between the rightmost particles

Asymptotic measure

Superposability

Models of evolution with or without selection



◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 三臣 - のへで



▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲臣▶ ★臣▶ ―臣 …の�?



 $\cdots < X_i(t) < \cdots < X_2(t) < X_1(t)$

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲臣▶ ▲臣▶ ―臣 … 釣�?



 $\cdots < X_i(t) < \cdots < X_2(t) < X_1(t)$

 $Prob(X_1(t), X_2(t), X_3(t)...)$?

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ★□▶ ★□▶ □ のQ@



$\cdots < X_i(t) < \cdots < X_2(t) < X_1(t)$

 $\lim_{t\to\infty} \operatorname{Prob}(X_1(t) - X_2(t), X_1(t) - X_3(t)...) ?$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ★□▶ ★□▶ □ のQ@

The models



Branching Brownian Motion

- Particles diffuse
- They split at rate 1

The models



Branching Brownian Motion

- Particles diffuse
- They split at rate 1



Branching random walk

> At each step, points split into two

・ロト ・ 理 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ うへつ

 The offspring are shifted by uncorrelated random amounts

n Ising spins $S_i = \pm 1$

$$E(\operatorname{Conf}) = -\sum_{i,j} J_{i,j} S_i S_j$$

<□▶ <□▶ < □▶ < □▶ < □▶ < □ > ○ < ○

n Ising spins $S_i = \pm 1$

$$E(\text{Conf}) = -\sum_{i,j} J_{i,j} S_i S_j$$



$$E_{n+1}=E_n-S_{n+1}\sum_j J_{j,n+1}S_j$$

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

correlated energy shifts

Branching random walk

n Ising spins $S_i = \pm 1$



$$E_{n+1}=E_n-S_{n+1}\sum_j J_{j,n+1}S_j$$

correlated energy shifts

uncorrelated energy shifts

(ロ) (型) (E) (E) (E) (O)

Branching random walk

n Ising spins $S_i = \pm 1$



$$E_{n+1}=E_n-S_{n+1}\sum_j J_{j,n+1}S_j$$

correlated energy shifts

Directed polymers

uncorrelated energy shifts

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ □ のQ@



▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲国▶ ▲国▶ - 国 - のへで



 $\operatorname{Pro}(X_1(t))$

・ロト ・個ト ・モト ・モト

æ

Branching Brownian Motion

Particles diffuse

 $\langle (\Delta x)^2 \rangle = 2dt$

They split at rate 1



◆□▶ ◆□▶ ★□▶ ★□▶ □ のQ@

Branching Brownian Motion

Particles diffuse

$$\langle (\Delta x)^2 \rangle = 2dt$$

They split at rate 1



▲ロト ▲周ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト ヨー のへで

Distribution of the rightmost particle

 $Q_0(x,t) = \operatorname{Proba}[X_1(t) < x]$

Branching Brownian Motion

Particles diffuse

$$\langle (\Delta x)^2 \rangle = 2dt$$

They split at rate 1



ション ふゆ く 山 マ チャット しょうくしゃ

Distribution of the rightmost particle

 $Q_0(x,t) = \operatorname{Proba}[X_1(t) < x] \qquad \qquad Q_0(x,0) = \left(\begin{array}{c} \\ 0 \end{array} \right)$

Branching Brownian Motion

Particles diffuse

$$\langle (\Delta x)^2 \rangle = 2dt$$

They split at rate 1



Distribution of the rightmost particle

$$Q_0(x,t) = \operatorname{Proba}[X_1(t) < x] \qquad \qquad Q_0(x,0) = \begin{pmatrix} & & & \\ 0 & & & \\ & & & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

$$Q_0(x, t + dt) = (1 - dt) \langle Q_0(x + \Delta x) \rangle + dt \ Q_0(x, t)^2$$

$$Q_0(x,t) = \operatorname{Proba}[X_1(t) < x]$$

$$Q_0(x,t) = \operatorname{Proba}[X_1(t) < x] \qquad \qquad Q_0(x,0) = \left(\underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} & & \\$$

<□▶ <□▶ < □▶ < □▶ < □▶ < □ > ○ < ○

$$Q_0(x,t) = \operatorname{Proba}[X_1(t) < x] \qquad \qquad Q_0(x,0) = \left(\bigcup_{0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}^1 \right)$$

$$Q_0(x,t+dt) = (1-dt)\langle Q_0(x+\Delta x)\rangle + dt \ Q_0(x,t)^2$$

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲臣▶ ★臣▶ ―臣 …の�?

$$Q_0(x,t) = \operatorname{Proba}[X_1(t) < x] \qquad \qquad Q_0(x,0) = \left(\underbrace{ \begin{bmatrix} & & \\ & & \\ & & \\ & & \end{bmatrix}^{-1} \right)$$

$$Q_0(x, t+dt) = (1-dt)\langle Q_0(x+\Delta x)\rangle + dt \ Q_0(x,t)^2$$

・ロト ・ 理 ト ・ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ うへつ

Taking $dt \ll 1$ (and as $\langle (\Delta x)^2 \rangle = 2dt$) one gets The Fisher-KPP equation

$$\partial_t Q_0 = \partial_x^2 Q_0 - Q_0 + Q_0^2$$

$$Q_0(x, t+dt) = (1-dt)\langle Q_0(x+\Delta x)\rangle + dt \ Q_0(x,t)^2$$

Taking $dt \ll 1$ (and as $\langle (\Delta x)^2 \rangle = 2dt$) one gets The Fisher-KPP equation

$$\partial_t Q_0 = \partial_x^2 Q_0 - Q_0 + Q_0^2$$



$$\psi_\lambda(x,t)=\left\langle\lambda^{[ext{number of particles on the right of }x ext{ at time }t]}
ight
angle,$$

 $\psi_{\lambda}(x,t) = \left\langle \lambda^{[\text{number of particles on the right of x at time t]}
ight
angle,$

 $\psi_{\lambda}(x,t+dt) = (1-dt)\langle \psi_{\lambda}(x+\Delta x) \rangle + dt \ \psi_{\lambda}(x,t)^2$

・ロト ・ 日 ・ モート ・ 田 ・ うへで

 $\psi_{\lambda}(x,t) = \left\langle \lambda^{[\text{number of particles on the right of x at time }t]}
ight
angle,$

 $\psi_{\lambda}(x,t+dt) = (1-dt)\langle \psi_{\lambda}(x+\Delta x) \rangle + dt \ \psi_{\lambda}(x,t)^2$

 $\psi_{\lambda}(x,t)$ satisfies the FKPP equation

 $\partial_t \psi_{\lambda} = \partial_x^2 \psi_{\lambda} - \psi_{\lambda} + \psi_{\lambda}^2,$

$$\psi_\lambda(x,t) = \left\langle \lambda^{[ext{number of particles on the right of x at time }t]}
ight
angle,$$

$$\psi_{\lambda}(x,t+dt) = (1-dt)\langle \psi_{\lambda}(x+\Delta x) \rangle + dt \ \psi_{\lambda}(x,t)^2$$

 $\psi_{\lambda}(x,t)$ satisfies the FKPP equation

$$\partial_t \psi_{\lambda} = \partial_x^2 \psi_{\lambda} - \psi_{\lambda} + \psi_{\lambda}^2$$
, with $\psi_{\lambda}(x, 0) = \left(\lambda_0 - \frac{1}{1}\right)$,

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲臣▶ ★臣▶ ―臣 …の�?

$$\psi_\lambda(x,t) = \left\langle \lambda^{[ext{number of particles on the right of } x ext{ at time } t]}
ight
angle,$$

$$\psi_{\lambda}(x,t+dt) = (1-dt)\langle \psi_{\lambda}(x+\Delta x) \rangle + dt \ \psi_{\lambda}(x,t)^2$$

 $\psi_{\lambda}(x,t)$ satisfies the FKPP equation



 ψ_{λ} gives the average positions of the rightmost particles

Bramson 1978

$$\partial_t \psi_{\lambda} = \partial_x^2 \psi_{\lambda} - \psi_{\lambda} + \psi_{\lambda}^2$$
, with $\psi_{\lambda}(x, 0) = \left(\lambda_0 - \frac{1}{0} \right)$,

For large *t*:

$$\psi_{\lambda}(x,t) \rightarrow F\left(x-2t-\frac{3}{2}\log t-A(\lambda)\right)$$

<□▶ <□▶ < □▶ < □▶ < □▶ < □ > ○ < ○

Bramson 1978

$$\partial_t \psi_{\lambda} = \partial_x^2 \psi_{\lambda} - \psi_{\lambda} + \psi_{\lambda}^2$$
, with $\psi_{\lambda}(x, 0) = \left(\lambda_0 - \frac{1}{0} \right)$,

For large *t*:

$$\psi_{\lambda}(x,t) \rightarrow F\left(x-2t-\frac{3}{2}\log t-A(\lambda)\right)$$

$$\sum_{n} \lambda^{n} \langle d_{n,n+1} \rangle = A(0) - A(\lambda)$$

<□▶ <□▶ < □▶ < □▶ < □▶ < □ > ○ < ○

For large *t*:

$$\psi_{\lambda}(x,t) \rightarrow F\left(x-2t-\frac{3}{2}\log t-A(\lambda)\right)$$

$$\sum_{n} \lambda^{n} \langle d_{n,n+1} \rangle = A(0) - A(\lambda)$$

 $d_{n,n+1}$ distance between the *n*-th and the n + 1-th point

For large *t*:

$$\psi_{\lambda}(x,t) \rightarrow F\left(x-2t-\frac{3}{2}\log t-A(\lambda)\right)$$

$$\sum_{n} \lambda^{n} \langle d_{n,n+1} \rangle = A(0) - A(\lambda)$$

All the properties of the tip can be obtained as delays

Bramson 1978

$$\partial_t \psi_{\lambda} = \partial_x^2 \psi_{\lambda} - \psi_{\lambda} + \psi_{\lambda}^2$$
, with $\psi_{\lambda}(x, 0) = \left(\lambda_0 - \frac{1}{2} \right)$,

For large *t*:

$$\psi_{\lambda}(x,t) \to F\left(x-2t-\frac{3}{2}\log t-A(\lambda)\right)$$

$$\sum_{n} \lambda^{n} \langle d_{n,n+1} \rangle = A(0) - A(\lambda)$$

For
$$\lambda \to 1$$
, $A(\lambda) \simeq \log(1-\lambda) + \log(-\log(1-\lambda))$

Asymptotics

For $\lambda \simeq 1$, $A(\lambda) = au_{\lambda} - \log au_{\lambda} + \mathcal{O}(1)$ with $au_{\lambda} = -\log(1-\lambda)$

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲臣▶ ★臣▶ ―臣 …の�?

Asymptotics

For
$$\lambda \simeq 1$$
, $A(\lambda) = \tau_{\lambda} - \log \tau_{\lambda} + \mathcal{O}(1)$ with $\tau_{\lambda} = -\log(1 - \lambda)$
 $\partial_t \psi_{\lambda} = \partial_x^2 \psi_{\lambda} + \psi_{\lambda}^2 - \psi_{\lambda}$ with $\psi_{\lambda}(x, 0) = \begin{pmatrix} \lambda & & \\ 0 & & 0 \end{pmatrix}$,

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 の�?
Asymptotics

For
$$\lambda \simeq 1$$
, $A(\lambda) = \tau_{\lambda} - \log \tau_{\lambda} + \mathcal{O}(1)$ with $\tau_{\lambda} = -\log(1-\lambda)$
 $\partial_t \psi_{\lambda} = \partial_x^2 \psi_{\lambda} + \psi_{\lambda}^2 - \psi_{\lambda}$ with $\psi_{\lambda}(x, 0) = \begin{pmatrix} \lambda & & \\ 0 & & 0 \end{pmatrix}$,

τ_λ = time needed for *ψ_λ*(−∞, 0) to "reach" 0.
1 − *ψ_λ* ≪ 1 for *t* ≪ *τ_λ*.

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲臣▶ ▲臣▶ ―臣 … 釣�?

Asymptotics

For
$$\lambda \simeq 1$$
, $A(\lambda) = \tau_{\lambda} - \log \tau_{\lambda} + \mathcal{O}(1)$ with $\tau_{\lambda} = -\log(1-\lambda)$
 $\partial_t \psi_{\lambda} = \partial_x^2 \psi_{\lambda} + \psi_{\lambda}^2 - \psi_{\lambda}$ with $\psi_{\lambda}(x, 0) = \begin{pmatrix} \lambda & & \\ 0 & & 0 \end{pmatrix}$,

• $au_{\lambda} =$ time needed for $\psi_{\lambda}(-\infty, 0)$ to "reach" 0.

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆□▶ □ のQ@

- $1 \psi_{\lambda} \ll 1$ for $t \ll \tau_{\lambda}$.
- Naive answer $A(\lambda) \simeq 2\tau_{\lambda}$

Asymptotics

For
$$\lambda \simeq 1$$
, $A(\lambda) = \tau_{\lambda} - \log \tau_{\lambda} + \mathcal{O}(1)$ with $\tau_{\lambda} = -\log(1-\lambda)$
 $\partial_t \psi_{\lambda} = \partial_x^2 \psi_{\lambda} + \psi_{\lambda}^2 - \psi_{\lambda}$ with $\psi_{\lambda}(x, 0) = \begin{pmatrix} \lambda & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix},$

• $\tau_{\lambda} = \text{time needed for } \psi_{\lambda}(-\infty, 0)$ to "reach" 0.

•
$$1 - \psi_{\lambda} \ll 1$$
 for $t \ll \tau_{\lambda}$.

• Naive answer $A(\lambda) \simeq 2\tau_{\lambda}$

$$\langle d_{n,n+1} \rangle_{\mathrm{st}} = \frac{1}{n} - \frac{1}{n \log n} + \cdots$$
 for large n .

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

Results : average distances

$$\langle d_{n,n+1} \rangle_{\mathrm{st}} = \frac{1}{n} - \frac{1}{n \log n} + \cdots$$
 for large n .

(ロ)、(型)、(E)、(E)、 E のQで

Results : average distances



Average distances as a function of 1/t. In the long time limit:

 $\langle d_{1,2}
angle \simeq 0.496 \quad \langle d_{2,3}
angle \simeq 0.303 \quad \langle d_{3,4}
angle \simeq 0.219 \ \langle d_{4,5}
angle \simeq 0.172 \quad \langle d_{5,6}
angle \simeq 0.142 \quad \langle d_{6,7}
angle \simeq 0.121$

The rightmost particles of a Poisson process

Definition

- (x, x + dx) is occupied by a particle with probability $\rho(x)dx$
- > no correlation between the occupations of disjoint intervals

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

The rightmost particles of a Poisson process

Definition

- (x, x + dx) is occupied by a particle with probability $\rho(x)dx$
- no correlation between the occupations of disjoint intervals

・ロト ・ 日 ・ エ = ・ ・ 日 ・ うへつ

For
$$ho(x)=e^{-lpha x}$$

Mean field spin glasses (valleys) REM, GREM Ruelle cascades The rightmost particles of a Poisson process

Definition

- (x, x + dx) is occupied by a particle with probability $\rho(x)dx$
- no correlation between the occupations of disjoint intervals

For
$$\rho(x) = e^{-\alpha x}$$

Mean field spin glasses (valleys) REM, GREM Ruelle cascades Distance between the nand n+1 particle

$$\langle d_{n,n+1} \rangle = \frac{1}{\alpha n}$$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三三 - のへで

Results : distance d_{12} in the BBM



$$P(d_{12}=a)\simeq 2e^{-2a}$$

Numerics

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲目▶ ▲目▶ 目 のへの

Results : distance d_{12} in the BBM



$$P(d_{12} = a) \simeq 2e^{-2a}$$

Numerics

Analytic

・ロト ・日下・ ・ ヨト æ

Superposability





・ロト ・個ト ・モト ・モト

æ

Superposability



・ロト ・聞ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

For large t, for the limiting measure of the distances $\frac{BBM}{BBM} + \frac{BBM}{BBM} = BBM$

Genealogies with and without selection

Asexual Reproduction



Wright-Fisher model (1930-1931)

- One parent model (asexual reproduction)
- Population of fixed size N
- Each individual i has n_i offspring (n_i random) (neutrality)
- One chooses N survivors among these n₁ + n₂ + ... offspring (neutrality)



イロト 不得下 不同下 不同下

Wright-Fisher model (1930-1931)

- One parent model (asexual reproduction)
- Population of fixed size N
- Each individual has its parent chosen at random in the previous generation (neutrality)



Coalescence times:

Age of the most recent common ancestor T_{max}



Coalescence times: Ages of the most recent common ancestors T_{max} and T_2



 T_{max} and T_2 are non self-averaging quantities

Evolution of T_{max} and \overline{T}_2

 T_{max} = age of the most recent common ancestor \overline{T}_2 = average over the population of T_2



・ロト ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・

Coalescence times:

Age T_p Kingman theory

 T_p = age of the most recent common ancestor of p individuals chosen at random



$$\langle T_p \rangle \simeq rac{2(p-1)}{p} N$$

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲目▶ ▲目▶ 二目 - のへぐ

MODELS OF EVOLUTION WITH SELECTION



- Each individual has 2 offspring at the next generation
- The fitness is transmitted up to some small change due to mutations
- The N right-most individuals are selected





・ロト ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・

э

Branching random walk





Branching random walk + selection





QUESTIONS

For a population of fixed size N

• Ages of the most recent common ancestors

・ロト ・個ト ・ヨト ・ヨト

32



Shape of the genealogical trees

Exponential model

- Population of size N
- Each individual has infinitely many offspring at the next generation
- An individual at position x has an offspring in

(x + y, x + y + dy) with probability $e^{-y} dy$ (Poisson process).



▶ The *N* right-most individuals are selected

Brunet D. Mueller Munier 2006-2007

 $\langle T_2 \rangle \simeq \log N$

ション ふゆ く 山 マ チャット しょうくしゃ

$$\frac{\langle T_3 \rangle}{\langle T_2 \rangle} \to \frac{5}{4}$$
$$\frac{\langle T_4 \rangle}{\langle T_2 \rangle} \to \frac{25}{18}$$

Exponential model

- Population of size N
- Each individual has infinitely many offspring at the next generation
- An individual at position x has an offspring in

(x + y, x + y + dy) with probability $e^{-y} dy$ (Poisson process).



▶ The *N* right-most individuals are selected

Brunet D. Mueller Munier 2006-2007

$$\frac{\langle T_3 \rangle}{\langle T_2 \rangle} \to \frac{5}{4}$$
$$\frac{\langle T_4 \rangle}{\langle T_2 \rangle} \to \frac{25}{18}$$

 $\langle T_2 \rangle \simeq \log N$

spin glass trees

ション ふゆ く 山 マ チャット しょうくしゃ

Statistics of the trees

	spin–glass	neutral
\bigwedge	3 4	1
\wedge	1 4	0

 $neutral \equiv Wright-Fisher model$

	spin-glass	neutral
\land	1 3	$\frac{2}{3}$
\bigwedge	1 6	1 3
\bigwedge	<u>1</u> 6	0
\bigwedge	2 9	0
\wedge	1 9	0

Coalescence times: simulations $N \rightarrow 10^5$



 T_p = age of the most common ancestor of p individuals chosen at random





(日) (四) (三)

æ

3.1

Conditionning on the speed

Brunet D. 2011

 X_t position of the population at time t

Weight the events by

$$e^{-\beta X_t}$$



Conditionning on the speed

Brunet D. 2011

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

 X_t position of the population at time t

Weight the events by

$$e^{-\beta X_t}$$

Then

$$\frac{\langle T_3 \rangle}{\langle T_2 \rangle} \bigg|_{\beta} = \frac{5 + 4\beta}{4 + 3\beta}$$

$$\frac{\langle T_4 \rangle}{\langle T_2 \rangle} \bigg|_{\beta} = \frac{100 + 204\beta + 133\beta^2 + 27\beta^3}{72 + 142\beta + 90\beta^2 + 18\beta^3}$$

Conditionning on the speed



▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲目▶ ▲目▶ 目 のへの

Coalescence rates

q_p rate at which p branches coalesce into 1.

▲□▶ ▲圖▶ ▲臣▶ ★臣▶ ―臣 …の�?

Coalescence rates

q_p rate at which p branches coalesce into 1.

	q_{p}/q_{2}	for $p > 2$
neutral		0
selection		$\frac{1}{p-1}$
$e^{-\beta X_t}$	$rac{(p-2)! \ \Gamma(eta+2)}{\Gamma(eta+p)}$	

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 の�?

Fisher equation and branching random walk

The Fisher-KPP equation

 $\frac{dc}{dt} = \frac{d^2c}{dx^2} + c - c^2$

selection



Q(x, t) probability that the right-most walker is at the right of x

$$\frac{dQ}{dt} = \frac{d^2Q}{dx^2} + Q - Q^2 + \text{Noise}$$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ = 臣 = のへで

Traveling wave equation + noise

$$\left| rac{dc}{dt} = rac{d^2c}{dx^2} + c - c^2 + rac{1}{\sqrt{N}} \ \eta(x,t)\sqrt{c(1-c)}
ight.$$

Brunet D. 1997

2006

2008



Cut-off approximation

Brunet Derrida 1997, 2001

Branching random walk + selection

$$\left|\frac{dc}{dt} = \frac{d^2c}{dx^2} + c - c^2 + \frac{1}{\sqrt{N}} \eta(x,t)\sqrt{c(1-c)}\right|$$



Replace the noise by a cut-off

$$\frac{dc}{dt} = \frac{d^2c}{dx^2} + a(c)(c - c^2) \quad \text{where} \quad a(c) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if } Nc \ge 1 \\ 0 & \text{if } Nc \ll 1 \end{cases}$$

Conclusion

Tip of a branching random walk \neq Poisson process

Selection \Rightarrow Bolthausen-Sznitman coalescent

Conditionning on the speed interpolates between Kingman and Bolthausen-Sznitman

Steady state measure for large ${\it N}$

Soluble case for the measure of the tip

Shape of the noisy KPP equation conditionned on the speed

・ロト ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・ ・ の へ ()

E. Brunet, B. Derrida

Statistics at the tip of a branching random walk and the delay of traveling waves Europhysics Letters 87, 60010, 2009

A branching random walk seen from the tip J. Stat. Phys. 143, 420-446 2010

How genealogies are affected by the speed of evolutionk preprint 2011

E. Brunet, B. Derrida, A. H. Mueller, S. Munier Noisy traveling waves: Effect of selection on genealogies Europhysics Letters, 76, 1-7 (2006)

Effect of selection on ancestry: an exactly soluble case and its phenomenological generalization Physical Review E 76, 041104 (2007)

・ロト ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・ ・ 日 ・ ・ つ へ ()